# Arizona Governor's Office of Highway Safety Automated Enforcement Survey

March 1, 2018



# Douglas A. Ducey Governor

Alberto C. Gutier

Director and Governor's Highway Safety Representative

#### **Background**

The FAST Act Final Rule (23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c), 23 CFR Part 1300.13 requires that a state receiving 402 funds that allows the use of automated enforcement (AE) systems, conduct a survey of agencies using these systems, biennially, starting with the first report due March 1, 2018.

In compliance with the new FAST act regulation 23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c)(d), the Arizona Governor's Office of Highway Safety (GOHS) sponsored a survey of results of its first Biennial Survey of State Automated Traffic Enforcement Systems. In recommendation by NHTSA, GOHS used the Insurance Institute for Highway Safety's (IIHS) list of "Communities using red/speed cameras".

GOHS found the IIHS list to be outdated by several years, which included communities/municipalities that no longer use red and or speed automated enforcement traffic systems. Many of the communities listed on the IIHS report used automated traffic enforcement systems on State highways that intersected those communities. A few years ago, the Arizona State Legislature banned the use of automated traffic enforcement system on state roads, including state highways. Due to communities using the automated enforcement traffic systems on these State highways, they no longer could operate them and subsequently, the systems were taken out.

GOHS identified only six municipalities, all located in the phoenix metro area, that still operate automated traffic enforcement systems on city streets. The surveys appear in Appendix A.

The following cities were sent the survey attached:

- City of Phoenix
- City of Scottsdale
- City of Chandler
- City of El Mirage
- City of Mesa
- Town of Paradise Valley

### Appendix A.

Automated Enforcement Survey Responses



	Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Chandler (Chandler Police Department) Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City Population: 300,000 Type of automated enforcement system used:
	Red Light Camera Speed Enforcement Camera Both
5.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT "Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes ✓ No Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) Don't Know
6.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA "Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) Don't Know
7.	Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
	Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned Contracted/Leased
	Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned Contracted/Leased
	Transparency
1.	Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
2.	Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
3.	Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
4.	Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
5.	Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No

1.	Are citations revie	ewed and signed by a sworn law enfo	rcement officer?
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
2.	Is there a process	s in place for dispute resolution?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
3.	Is the automated	enforcement program audited?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes√No If yes, how of	ten? Yearly
	Red Light Came	ra: Yes√No If yes, how of	ten? Yearly
		Safety Attr	ibutes
1.	Is traffic data (eng	gineering & crash) utilized to determin	ne placement of enforcement platforms?
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
2.	•	ion/political subdivision analyze trafficelements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?	c data to determine its automated enforcement's
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes No No
Da	ata recorded by:	Detective Daryl Nyby Name daryl.nyby@chandleraz.gov Email (480) 782-4217	02/22/2018 Date



2.	Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of El Mirage (El Mirage Police Department) Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City Population: 33,010 Type of automated enforcement system used:
	Red Light Camera Speed Enforcement Camera V Both
5.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT "Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes ✓ No Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) Don't Know
6.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA "Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) On't Know
7.	Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
	Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ☐ Contracted/Leased ✓
	Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned Contracted/Leased
	Transparency
1.	Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes No
2.	Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes No
3.	Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes No
4.	Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
5.	Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes No

1.	Are citations revie	ewed and signed by a sworn law enfo	rcement officer?
	Speed Camera:	Yes No ✓ Red Light Camera:	Yes No
2.	Is there a process	s in place for dispute resolution?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes No
3.	Is the automated	enforcement program audited?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes√No If yes, how of	ten?
	Red Light Came	ra: Yes No If yes, how of	ten?
		Safety Attr	ibutes
1.	Is traffic data (eng	gineering & crash) utilized to determin	ne placement of enforcement platforms?
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes No
2.	-	ion/political subdivision analyze trafficelements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?	c data to determine its automated enforcement's
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes No
Da	ita recorded by:	Bryan Dezso Name bdezso@elmirageaz.gov	02/28/2018 Date
		Email (623) 500-3026 Phone	



2. 3.	Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Mesa (Mesa Police Department) Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City Population: Approximately 490,000 Type of automated enforcement system used:
	Red Light Camera Speed Enforcement Camera Both
5.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT "Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes ✓ No Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) Don't Know
6.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA "Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes ✓ No Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) Don't Know
7.	Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
	Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ✓ Contracted/Leased ✓
	Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ✓ Contracted/Leased
	Transparency
1.	Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
2.	Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
3.	Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
4.	Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
5.	Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?

1.	Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?		
	Speed Camera: Ye	es No ✓ Red Light Camera:	Yes No ✓
2.	. Is there a process in	place for dispute resolution?	
	Speed Camera: Ye	es ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
3.	. Is the automated enfo	orcement program audited?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes√No If yes, how often	en? All aspects at different time frames: Monthly, quarterly,
	Red Light Camera:	Yes√No If yes, how often	en? All aspects at different time frames: Monthly, quarterly,
		Safety Attri	butes
1.	. Is traffic data (engine	ering & crash) utilized to determine	e placement of enforcement platforms?
	Speed Camera: Ye	es ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
2.	-	political subdivision analyze traffic nents (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?	data to determine its automated enforcement's
	Speed Camera: Ye	es ✓ No  Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
Da	Na	. Tony Landato #10016 ame nthony.landato@mesaaz.gov	02-26-2018 Date
		nail	
		30-644-2620 none	



1. 2. 3. 4.	Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Phoenix (Phoenix Police Department) Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City Population: 1,615,017 Type of automated enforcement system used:
	Red Light Camera Speed Enforcement Camera Both
5.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT "Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) Don't Know
6.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA "Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) Don't Know
7.	Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
	Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ☐ Contracted/Leased ✓
	Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned Contracted/Leased
	Transparency
1.	Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
2.	Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
3.	Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
4.	Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
5.	Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
	Speed Camera: Yes No ✓ Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No

1.	. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?	
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No	
2.	2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?	
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No	
3.	3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?	
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No If yes, how often? Random, once during current 3	year contract.
	Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No If yes, how often? Random, once during current 3	/ear contract.
	Safety Attributes	
1.	1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement placement	atforms?
	Speed Camera: Yes No ✓ Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No	
2.	<ol><li>Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automate impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?</li></ol>	ed enforcement's
	Speed Camera: Yes No ✓ Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No	
Da	Data recorded by:  Lt. Patrick C. Hofmann #4933  Name  patrick.hofmann@phoenix.gov  Email  (602) 495-6701  Phone	



1. 2. 3. 4.	Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Scottsdale (Scottsdale Police Department) Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City Population: 246,000 Type of automated enforcement system used:
	Red Light Camera Speed Enforcement Camera Both
5.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT "Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) Don't Know
6.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA "Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) Don't Know
7.	Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
	Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ☐ Contracted/Leased ✓
	Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned Contracted/Leased
	Transparency
1.	Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
2.	Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
3.	Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
4.	Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
5.	Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No

1.	Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No V
2.	Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
3.	Is the automated enforcement program audited?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No If yes, how often? NOT ON SET SCHEDULE
	Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No If yes, how often? NOT ON SET SCHEDULE
	Safety Attributes
1.	Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
2.	Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement's impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No
Da	Ata recorded by:  ALEX RISTUCCIA B1379  Name  ARISTUCCIA@SCOTTSDALEAZ.GOV  Email  (480) 312-5643  Phone



1. 2. 3. 4.	Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: Town of Paradise Valley (Paradise Valley Police Department) Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): Town Population: 13,387 Type of automated enforcement system used:
	Red Light Camera Speed Enforcement Camera Both
5.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT "Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) Don't Know
6.	Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA "Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines" when implementing its automated enforcement system?
	Yes No Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) Don't Know
7.	Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
	Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ✓ Contracted/Leased ✓
	Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned Contracted/Leased
	Transparency
1.	Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
2.	Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
3.	Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No ✓ Red Light Camera: Yes No ✓
4.	Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
	Speed Camera: Yes No Red Light Camera: Yes No
5.	Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
	Speed Camera: Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera: Yes ✓ No

1.	Are citations revie	ewed and signed by a sworn law enfo	rcement officer?
	Speed Camera:	Yes No ✓ Red Light Camera:	Yes No ✓
2.	Is there a process	s in place for dispute resolution?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
3.	Is the automated	enforcement program audited?	
	Speed Camera:	Yes No If yes, how of	ten? N/A
	Red Light Came	ra: Yes No If yes, how of	ten? N/A
		Safety Attr	ibutes
1.	Is traffic data (eng	gineering & crash) utilized to determin	ne placement of enforcement platforms?
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
2.	•	ion/political subdivision analyze trafficelements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?	c data to determine its automated enforcement's
	Speed Camera:	Yes ✓ No Red Light Camera:	Yes√No
Da	ta recorded by:	Robert Clement Name	02/28/2018 Date
		rclement@paradisevalleyaz.gov Email	
		(480) 948-7410 Phone	