Arizona Governor’s Office of Highway Safety

Automated Enforcement Survey

March 1, 2018

Douglas A. Ducey
Governor

Alberto C. Gutier
Director and Governor’s Highway Safety Representative
**Background**

The FAST Act Final Rule (23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c), 23 CFR Part 1300.13 requires that a state receiving 402 funds that allows the use of automated enforcement (AE) systems, conduct a survey of agencies using these systems, biennially, starting with the first report due March 1, 2018.

In compliance with the new FAST act regulation 23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c)(d), the Arizona Governor’s Office of Highway Safety (GOHS) sponsored a survey of results of its first Biennial Survey of State Automated Traffic Enforcement Systems. In recommendation by NHTSA, GOHS used the Insurance Institute for Highway Safety’s (IIHS) list of “Communities using red/speed cameras”.

GOHS found the IIHS list to be outdated by several years, which included communities/municipalities that no longer use red and or speed automated enforcement traffic systems. Many of the communities listed on the IIHS report used automated traffic enforcement systems on State highways that intersected those communities. A few years ago, the Arizona State Legislature banned the use of automated traffic enforcement system on state roads, including state highways. Due to communities using the automated enforcement traffic systems on these State highways, they no longer could operate them and subsequently, the systems were taken out.

GOHS identified only six municipalities, all located in the phoenix metro area, that still operate automated traffic enforcement systems on city streets. The surveys appear in Appendix A.

The following cities were sent the survey attached:

- City of Phoenix
- City of Scottsdale
- City of Chandler
- City of El Mirage
- City of Mesa
- Town of Paradise Valley
Appendix A.

Automated Enforcement Survey Responses
FIXING AMERICA’S SURFACE TRANSPORTATION (FAST ACT)
Biennial Survey of State Automated Traffic Enforcement Systems
23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c)(d)

General

1. Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Chandler (Chandler Police Department)
2. Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City
3. Population: 300,000
4. Type of automated enforcement system used:
   - Red Light Camera
   - Speed Enforcement Camera
   - Both ✔

5. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT “Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes ✔
   - No
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras)
   - Don’t Know

6. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA “Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes ✔
   - No
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras)
   - Don’t Know

7. Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
   - Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned
   - Contracted/Leased ✔
   - Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned
   - Contracted/Leased ✔

Transparency

1. Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔

2. Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔

3. Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔

4. Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔

5. Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔

City of Chandler (Chandler Police Department)
(Survey Continued)

Accountability

1. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?

   Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐
   Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?

   Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐
   Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?

   Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐ If yes, how often? Yearly
   Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐ If yes, how often? Yearly

Safety Attributes

1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?

   Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐
   Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

2. Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement’s impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?

   Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐
   Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

Data recorded by: Detective Daryl Nyby
Name
daryl.nyby@chandleraz.gov
Email
(480) 782-4217
Phone

02/22/2018
Date
**FIXING AMERICA’S SURFACE TRANSPORTATION (FAST ACT)**

**Biennial Survey of State Automated Traffic Enforcement Systems**

23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c)(d)

**General**

1. Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of El Mirage (El Mirage Police Department)
2. Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City
3. Population: 33,010
4. Type of automated enforcement system used:
   - [ ] Red Light Camera
   - [x] Speed Enforcement Camera
   - [ ] Both

5. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT “Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - [x] Yes
   - [ ] No
   - [ ] Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras)
   - [ ] Don’t Know

6. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA “Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - [ ] Yes
   - [x] No
   - [x] Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras)
   - [ ] Don’t Know

7. Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
   - **Speed Camera:**
     - Jurisdiction-owned
     - Contracted/Leased [x]
   - **Red Light Camera:**
     - Jurisdiction-owned
     - Contracted/Leased

**Transparency**

1. Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes [x] No
   - **Red Light Camera:**

2. Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes [x] No
   - **Red Light Camera:**

3. Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes [x] No
   - **Red Light Camera:**

4. Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes [x] No
   - **Red Light Camera:**

5. Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes [x] No
   - **Red Light Camera:**

---

Arizona Governor’s Office of Highway Safety
FY 2018 Automated Traffic Enforcement Survey
Accountability

1. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?

   Speed Camera:  Yes [ ] No [✓]  Red Light Camera:  Yes [ ] No [ ]

2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?

   Speed Camera:  Yes [✓] No [ ]  Red Light Camera:  Yes [ ] No [ ]

3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?

   Speed Camera:  Yes [✓] No [ ] If yes, how often?

   Red Light Camera:  Yes [ ] No [ ] If yes, how often?

Safety Attributes

1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?

   Speed Camera:  Yes [✓] No [ ]  Red Light Camera:  Yes [ ] No [ ]

2. Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement’s impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?

   Speed Camera:  Yes [✓] No [ ]  Red Light Camera:  Yes [ ] No [ ]

Data recorded by: Bryan Dezso
Name  bdezso@elmirageaz.gov
Email  (623) 500-3026
Phone  02/28/2018
Date
## General

1. Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Mesa (Mesa Police Department)
2. Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City
3. Population: Approximately 490,000
4. Type of automated enforcement system used:
   - Red Light Camera ☑
   - Speed Enforcement Camera ☑
   - Both ☑

5. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT “Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes ☑
   - No ☑
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras) ☑
   - Don’t Know ☑

6. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA “Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes ☑
   - No ☑
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras) ☑
   - Don’t Know ☑

7. Ownership of system (camera & equipment):  
   - Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ☑
   - Contracted/Leased ☑
   - Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned ☑
   - Contracted/Leased ☑

## Transparency

1. Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☑
   - Red Light Camera: No ☑

2. Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☑
   - Red Light Camera: No ☑

3. Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☑
   - Red Light Camera: No ☑

4. Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☑
   - Red Light Camera: No ☑

5. Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☑
   - Red Light Camera: No ☑
(Survey Continued)

Accountability

1. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?
   Speed Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐ Red Light Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐

2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?
   Speed Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐ Red Light Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐

3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?
   Speed Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐ If yes, how often? All aspects at different time frames: Monthly, quarterly, etc.
   Red Light Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐ If yes, how often? All aspects at different time frames: Monthly, quarterly, etc.

Safety Attributes

1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?
   Speed Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐ Red Light Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐

2. Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement’s impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?
   Speed Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐ Red Light Camera: Yes ☑ No ☐

Data recorded by: Lt. Tony Landato #10016
Name: anthony.landato@mesaaz.gov
Email: 480-644-2620
Phone: 02-26-2018
FIXING AMERICA’S SURFACE TRANSPORTATION (FAST ACT)
Biennial Survey of State Automated Traffic Enforcement Systems
23 CFR Part 1300.13 (c)(d)

General

1. Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Phoenix (Phoenix Police Department)
2. Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City
3. Population: 1,615,017
4. Type of automated enforcement system used:
   - Red Light Camera
   - Speed Enforcement Camera
   - Both

5. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT “Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras)
   - Don’t Know

6. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA “Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras)
   - Don’t Know

7. Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
   - Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned
   - Contracted/Leased
   - Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned
   - Contracted/Leased

Transparency

1. Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes
   - No

2. Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes
   - No

3. Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes
   - No

4. Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
   - Speed Camera: Yes
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes
   - No

5. Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
   - Speed Camera: Yes
   - No
   - Red Light Camera: Yes
   - No
Accountability

1. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐ If yes, how often? Random, once during current 3 year contract.
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐ If yes, how often? Random, once during current 3 year contract.

Safety Attributes

1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☐ No ✔
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

2. Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement’s impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?
   - Speed Camera: Yes ☐ No ✔
   - Red Light Camera: Yes ✔ No ☐

Data recorded by: Lt. Patrick C. Hofmann #4933
Name: Patrick.Hofmann@Phoenix.gov
Email: (602) 495-6701
Phone: 02/27/2018
Date:
1. Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision: City of Scottsdale (Scottsdale Police Department)
2. Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.): City
3. Population: 246,000
4. Type of automated enforcement system used:
   - Red Light Camera
   - Speed Enforcement Camera
   - Both
5. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT “Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras)
   - Don’t Know
6. Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA “Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?
   - Yes
   - No
   - Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras)
   - Don’t Know
7. Ownership of system (camera & equipment):
   - Speed Camera: Jurisdiction-owned
   - Contracted/Leased
   - Red Light Camera: Jurisdiction-owned
   - Contracted/Leased
8. Transparency:
   1. Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?
      - Speed Camera: Yes
      - No
      - Red Light Camera: Yes
      - No
   2. Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?
      - Speed Camera: Yes
      - No
      - Red Light Camera: Yes
      - No
   3. Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?
      - Speed Camera: Yes
      - No
      - Red Light Camera: Yes
      - No
   4. Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?
      - Speed Camera: Yes
      - No
      - Red Light Camera: Yes
      - No
   5. Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?
      - Speed Camera: Yes
      - No
      - Red Light Camera: Yes
      - No
Accountability

1. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?
   Speed Camera: Yes [ ] No [✓] Red Light Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ]

2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?
   Speed Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ] Red Light Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ]

3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?
   Speed Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ] If yes, how often? NOT ON SET SCHEDULE
   Red Light Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ] If yes, how often? NOT ON SET SCHEDULE

Safety Attributes

1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?
   Speed Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ] Red Light Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ]

2. Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement's impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?
   Speed Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ] Red Light Camera: Yes [✓] No [ ]

Data recorded by: ALEX RISTUCCIA B1379
Name
ARISTUCCIA@SCOTTSDALEAZ.GOV
Email
(480) 312-5643
Phone

02/27/2018
Date
### General

1. **Name of Jurisdiction/Political Subdivision:** Town of Paradise Valley (Paradise Valley Police Department)  
2. **Type of Government Entity (city, state, etc.):** Town  
3. **Population:** 13,387  
4. **Type of automated enforcement system used:**
   - **Red Light Camera:** Yes
   - **Speed Enforcement Camera:** Yes
   - **Both:** Yes

5. **Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow federal DOT “Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?**
   - **Yes:**
   - **No:**
   - **Not Applicable (No Automated Speed Cameras):**
   - **Don’t Know:** Yes

6. **Did the jurisdiction/political subdivision refer to and follow FHWA “Red Light Camera Systems Operational Guidelines” when implementing its automated enforcement system?**
   - **Yes:**
   - **No:**
   - **Not Applicable (No Automated Red Light Cameras):**
   - **Don’t Know:** Yes

7. **Ownership of system (camera & equipment):**
   - **Speed Camera:** Jurisdiction-owned
   - **Contracted/Leased:** Yes
   - **Red Light Camera:** Jurisdiction-owned
   - **Contracted/Leased:** Yes

### Transparency

1. **Are placement locations of automated enforcement publicly available?**
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes
   - **Red Light Camera:** Yes

2. **Is information regarding automated enforcement revenue publicly available?**
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes
   - **Red Light Camera:** Yes

3. **Is information regarding the disbursement of this revenue publicly available?**
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes
   - **Red Light Camera:** Yes

4. **Is the number of automated enforcement citations issued publicly available?**
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes
   - **Red Light Camera:** Yes

5. **Upon deployment at a specific location, is there a warning period before citations are issued?**
   - **Speed Camera:** Yes
   - **Red Light Camera:** Yes
(Survey Continued)

Accountability

1. Are citations reviewed and signed by a sworn law enforcement officer?
   
   Speed Camera: Yes [ ] No [X] Red Light Camera: Yes [ ] No [X]

2. Is there a process in place for dispute resolution?
   
   Speed Camera: Yes [X] No [ ] Red Light Camera: Yes [X] No [ ]

3. Is the automated enforcement program audited?
   
   Speed Camera: Yes [ ] No [ ] If yes, how often? N/A
   Red Light Camera: Yes [ ] No [ ] If yes, how often? N/A

Safety Attributes

1. Is traffic data (engineering & crash) utilized to determine placement of enforcement platforms?
   
   Speed Camera: Yes [X] No [ ] Red Light Camera: Yes [X] No [ ]

2. Does the jurisdiction/political subdivision analyze traffic data to determine its automated enforcement’s impact on safety elements (i.e. crashes, speed, etc.)?
   
   Speed Camera: Yes [X] No [ ] Red Light Camera: Yes [X] No [ ]

Data recorded by: Robert Clement
Name
rclment@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Email
(480) 948-7410
Phone
02/28/2018
Date